



Safe to Eat Workgroup (STEW) Meeting Notes



Wednesday, April 24, 2024
9:30 AM - 11:30 AM (Pacific)

[Link to Meeting Slides](#) | [Link to Meeting Recording](#)

Agenda Overview

Item	Topic	Lead	Time
1.	Roll Call, Agenda Review, Goals of the Meeting	Jay Davis	9:30 AM (10 min)
2.	Information: Quick Updates Desired Outcome: Inform and update the STEW	Jay Davis	9:40 AM (20 min)
3.	Information: Long-term Monitoring Priorities Assessment Process - Decisions & Next Steps Desired Outcome: Inform and update the STEW	Anna Holder	10:00 AM (30 min)
4.	Information: Draft Report Updates Desired Outcome: Inform and update the STEW	Jay Davis	10:30 AM (20 min)
5.	Discussion: SWAMP Data Dashboard Demo & Feedback Desired Outcome: Inform, get feedback from the STEW	Michelle Tang	10:50 AM (30 min)
6.	Wrap-up and Adjourn	Anna Holder	11:20 AM (10 min)

Agenda Details

Item 1. Roll Call, Agenda Review, Goals of the Meeting

- See [slides](#) (3-4) and [recording](#) for full discussion

Program/STEW Leads

Ali Dunn (SWAMP)
 Anna Holder (SWAMP)
 Jay Davis (SFEI)

Peer Review Panel

Harry Ohlendorf (Independent)
 Christopher (Chris) Schmitt (U.S. Geological Survey)

OEHHA

Loren Chumney
 Wesley (Wes) Smith

MLML/MPSL

Autumn Bonnema
 Scot Lucas

Water Quality Monitoring Council

Nick Martorano

State Board

OIMA/SWAMP
 Chad Fearing
 Jennifer Salisbury
 Elena Suglia
 Michelle Tang

Regional Boards

R1: Rich Fadness
 R2: Gerardo Martinez
 R3:
 R4:
 R5:
 R6: Laurie Scribe
 R7:
 R8:
 R9:

Other

Paula Jewell (Camp Pendleton)
 Duyen Kauffman (Biomonitoring California)
 Mina Ziaei (San Diego County Water Authority)

Item 2. Quick Updates

- See [slides](#) (5-10) and [recording](#) for full discussion

Monitoring Data & Documentation Update

Year	Monitoring Element	Data Status (Est. completion)	Document Status (Est. completion)
2020	Coast (Central CA)	Remaining organics data pushed to CEDEN in Feb 2024!	Cruise Report Interpretive Report (2025)
2021	Lakes (Panel 4)	ETA for organics data to be available in CEDEN (May 2024)	Cruise Report Data Report (2024*)
2022	Realignment (Region 9)	ETA for organics data to be available in CEDEN (TBD, after 2021 Data)	Cruise Report Data Report (2024*)
	Rivers (Region 5)		Cruise Report Data Report (2024*)

Year	Monitoring Element	Data Status (Est. completion)	Document Status (Est. completion)
	Special Project (Region 3)		NA - up to R3 project leads to write report
2023	Lakes (Panel 5)	ETA for metals data to be available in CEDEN (Jul 2024) ETA for organics data to be available in CEDEN (TBD, after 2021 Data)	Cruise Report Data Report (2024*) Interpretive Report (2025)
2024	Coast (Central & Northern CA)	Monitoring to begin in May 2024 Regular updates to be shared via STEW Email List	Monitoring Plan Data Report (2025) Interpretive Report (2026)
	PFAS Archive Project	Preparation of Archives - TBD Ship to Lab for Analysis - TBD ETA for organics data to be available in CEDEN - TBD, after 2023 Data	TBD

* Upon receipt of organics data

Regular Quick Updates

- New fish consumption advisories
 - [Lake Morena \(San Diego County, Feb 2024\)](#)
 - [Crowley Lake \(Mono County, Apr 2024\)](#)
 - *Coming soon:* Gene Wash Reservoir (San Bernardino County)
 - OEHHA is currently developing the list of advisories that will be developed; the updated priority list will be shared with the STEW once complete - likely at the July STEW Meeting
- Updates on TMDLs
 - No one present to provide updates.
- Monitoring Council Updates
 - All 2024 meetings will be virtual until further notice.
 - Last meeting: Apr 5 - see the [Agenda](#) and [Recording](#) for details
 - [Next meeting](#): Jun 27
- [Tribal Bioaccumulation Monitoring Training Series](#)
 - Past Training Materials now available!
 - Jan: Introduction to the Bioaccumulation Monitoring Program and Safe to Eat Workgroup - [Slides](#) | [Recording](#)
 - Feb: Bioaccumulation monitoring study design & preparation - [Slides](#) | [Recording](#)

- Mar: Bioaccumulation monitoring sample collection protocols & processing - [Slides](#) | [Recording](#)
 - If you attended a training or reviewed resources *after* a training - please consider [completing this survey](#) to share your feedback with us!
 - Next Training - Tue. Sep. 17, 2024 - Bioaccumulation monitoring data QAQC & submission to SWAMP/CEDEN - [Registration Link](#) (Tribes only, please!)
- Other updates from the group
 - [San Francisco Bay RMP](#) sport fish monitoring in 2024 - sampling starts in May 2024
 - San Francisco Bay consumption survey questionnaire development
 - Funded by San Francisco Regional Water Board
 - Draft report on questionnaire development will be distributed soon
 - 3rd Workshop with Community-Based Organizations on May 13
 - Project will wrap in May 2024
 - [All Positives Possible](#) Carquinez Strait monitoring study
 - Funded by US EPA
 - Fish monitoring for mercury, PCBs, PFAS at four locations Sep-Nov 2023
 - Sampling completed and included San Francisco Bay RMP methods and collection by community members
 - Sample processing & analysis underway by MLML and SGS-Axys

Action Items

- MPSL & Anna: Send regular 2024 Coast monitoring updates to the STEW Email List
- Regarding the Tribally-centered Training Series
 - **If you represent a Tribe** and are interested in the Training Series, please [register for the course\(s\) of interest to you!](#)
 - **If you attended a training or reviewed resources after a training**, please consider [completing this survey](#) to share your feedback with us!

Item 3. Long-term Monitoring Priorities Assessment Process - Decisions & Next Steps

The STEW has been discussing the 2024 Long-term Monitoring Priorities Assessment in some capacity since Jan 2023. Feedback was collected (Oct 2023-Feb 2024), synthesized and discussed (Mar 2024), and presented to SWAMP Management to make final priority decisions (Apr 2024). A recap of the process, review of the decisions that have been made by SWAMP Management, and associated next steps will be presented.

Discussion

- See [slides](#) (11-33) and [recording](#) for full discussion
- Regarding the PFAS Archive Project:
 - Have the archive samples already been analyzed for mercury and/or PCBs?
 - Yes.

- Is there more information on the process and timelines for the project?
 - Not yet. More detailed information will be shared as soon as it is available.
- Regarding the Annual Feedback Process Timeline:
 - Note that requests that include water bodies that contain endangered species, requests should be made more than 1 year in advance to ensure federal permits can come through in time.
 - For example - if interested in sampling a lake that contains an endangered species in 2026, it is strongly recommended that the request be submitted by the Sep 1, 2024 deadline, not the Sep 1, 2025 deadline which would be the usual deadline for submitting requests for the 2026 monitoring season.
- Regarding Regional Board Funding Contributions:
 - What are the mechanisms that will be used for Regional Boards to contribute funds?
 - Regional Boards will be able to contribute SWAMP or discretionary funds to the OIMA Statewide Lab Services and Science Contracts.
 - Can Regional Boards add funds to the OEHHA contract to support the development of more fish advisories?
 - TBD - will follow-up offline to discuss.
- Regarding the use of PFAS data:
 - How will the data be used once we have it? We should be thinking about this now, before money data are collected.
 - OEHHA will use the Program's data to understand: relevant exposure of PFAS from different types of species, environmental fate and transport through the system, PFAS behaviors and risk as a class. All of which will inform the development of advisory tissue levels (ATLs) and other thresholds.
 - OEHHA is in the process of developing ATLs for PFAS; having more data available will increase the robustness of ATLs and reduce the need to update over time.
 - Do OEHHA ATLs take into account exposure of pollutants from other pathways besides fish consumption?
 - They have not to this point because most of the ATLs are for chemicals where (one of) the main source of exposure comes from fish consumption. PFAS exposure is different and will be considered and incorporated into the development of the PFAS ATL.
 - Note that on April 5, 2024, OEHHA adopted Public Health Goals (PHGs) for [PFOA and PFOS in drinking water](#). This triggers the Water Board to consider [maximum contaminant levels \(MCLs\) in drinking water](#), which is an important first step for California when it comes to developing thresholds for tissue.
 - Also see [Mar 2024 Meeting Notes](#) (page 5) for more detailed PFAS discussions

Action Items

- Jay & Anna:
 - Draft Long-term Monitoring Plan (2025-2029)
 - Draft 2025-2026 Lakes Monitoring Plan
 - Present drafts at July 31 STEW Meeting
- All: Start thinking about potential requests you will want to submit for 2025 Lakes Monitoring during the annual feedback process (Jul - Sep 2024)
- Regional Boards: Start thinking about which year(s) you might want to contribute discretionary / SWAMP funds to leverage already planned Statewide monitoring (sampling, analysis & archives)

Item 4. Draft Report Updates

Data for a number of different data reports are getting processed. During this item, an update on status and timelines of such reports will be presented.

Discussion

- See [slides](#) (34-43) and [recording](#) for full discussion
- Regarding 2021 Lakes (Panel 4) Data Refresher/Preview:
 - Other ideas to explore in the interpretive report:
 - Indices of coal burning or production that are associated with the release of mercury into the atmosphere (e.g. Asian coal burning impacts in CA)
 - Water level (or similar covariates) correlation with pollutant concentrations in fish
 - Recent research related to dry deposition of mercury
 - Effect of wildfires on pollutant concentrations in fish (e.g. via volatilization of mercury and smoke deposition)
 - Also see the [Apr 2023 Meeting Notes](#) for a more detailed overview of the preliminary data

Action Items

- Jay:
 - Draft Data Reports, work with Anna to distribute to the STEW for review and feedback
 - Present Report updates at Jul & Oct STEW Meetings
 - Finalize Data Reports, distribute and post on website
- All: Keep an eye out for draft reports, review and provide feedback when available.

Item 5. SWAMP Data Dashboard Demo & Feedback

SWAMP Staff have been developing an interactive dashboard to display SWAMP generated monitoring data and information (SWAMP Data Dashboard). The SWAMP Data Dashboard will include 'high level' information about SWAMP monitoring, including monitoring locations, results, purpose of monitoring, etc. Conceptually, the user will be able to 'dive deeper' into data generated by each of the statewide and regional monitoring programs. SWAMP Bioaccumulation Monitoring Program data have been added recently. An update and demonstration of the SWAMP Data Dashboard and available Program data will be presented. The STEW may ask questions and/or provide feedback on desired features or functionality they would like to see incorporated in future updates at this time.

Discussion

- See [slide](#) (44) and [recording](#) for full discussion
- Also see link to [SWAMP Data Dashboard](#) - please note:
 - Updates have gone live since the meeting, so the link to the test site that was used for the demo during the meeting is no longer needed.
 - The quickest way to view available bioaccumulation data is to use the "Statewide monitoring program" dropdown (left panel), select "Bioaccumulation Monitoring Program" and click the "Apply filters" button
- Also see link to the [Feedback Form](#) - please note:
 - Submitting feedback/request(s) to the form will ensure consideration during future updates, but *does not guarantee* the feedback/request(s) will be pursued or incorporated.
 - An individual may submit multiple responses over time.
 - There is no deadline to complete this form.
- What do the orange triangles indicating a "Reference site" mean?
 - The orange triangles represent reference sites for the [SWAMP Statewide Bioassessment Monitoring Program](#). Reference sites represent wadeable stream and river locations throughout California that have reference conditions, which define the biological conditions expected in healthy streams when human activity in the environment is absent or minimal.
 - If other programs sample at reference sites, the orange triangle will continue to represent the location.
- Why is there a broad area that is dark green on the North Coast?
 - The green lines/polygons represent listings from the [2020-2022 Integrated Report](#); dark green lines/polygons represent water bodies that have been added to the 303(d) list of impaired waterbodies - and have been listed as impaired for one or more pollutants; light green lines/polygons represent water bodies that have *not* been listed as impaired for any pollutants on the 303(d) list.
 - The broad dark green area on the North Coast exists because there are sediment and temperature issues (aka impairments) that impact the watershed as a whole, thus resulting in the whole watershed being listed as impaired for one or more pollutants (i.e. sediment and/or temperature).

- Note shared in the chat: The [2024 Integrated Report](#) is being finalized and approved by US EPA - once final the data in the dashboard will reflect the 2024 Integrated Report.
- In the Lake Piru results - it looks like there is a point that has substantially lower mercury concentrations than the other points in that lake. Does that low point represent prey fish or largemouth bass?
 - Likely prey fish, but need to confirm.
 - Recommend separating results for large fish (e.g. largemouth bass) from prey fish, which are much smaller and tend to have substantially lower pollutant concentrations.
- If you want to capture all data for a specific river, how did you decide what stations should be included? For example, if a sampling station was very nearby in a feeder tributary, would that be included or excluded? Is there a buffer?
 - The SWAMP Data Dashboard does not have that functionality (e.g. bringing up all data associated with an entire water body) at this time. However, it is on the list of functionality requests and will be explored in the future.
 - Note shared in the chat: The integrated report map should have that functionality. They break up water body segments based on a 200 m spatial independence metric.
- Are fish collected in earlier years (e.g. 2007) comparable to those collected in more recent years?
 - Yes - length adjusted means are comparable over time.
- Other questions asked and answered in the chat:
 - Are the non-detects (NDs) part of the data pull?
 - Yes, NDs are included as part of the data pull. They are represented on the graph as their reported value (if available); if the reported value is null or not valid, then we use 1/2 MDL. The dashboard also colors the points differently if there are ND values present (gray with a dashed border). There is also some language included explaining how the ND values are handled.
 - Did you say at the beginning that this includes only data from 2000 onward or did I mishear?
 - That's correct - 2000 data and beyond

Action Items

- Michelle: Continue development of bioaccumulation section of SWAMP Data Dashboard
- Anna: Create [Feedback Form](#), send to STEW once available.
- All: Review [SWAMP Data Dashboard](#), complete [Feedback Form](#) as appropriate.

Item 6. Wrap-up and Adjourn

- Review action items
- Review items for next meeting

Discussion

- See [slides](#) (45-52) and [recording](#) for full discussion
- No additional questions or discussion

Action Items

- Anna: complete the following, send to STEW email list once complete:
 - Post Apr 24 meeting materials and recording on the [Meetings page](#).
- All:
 - Review the [Meetings page](#) and register for Zoom calls, download calendar invites.
 - Email anna.holder@waterboards.ca.gov with future STEW meeting speaker/topic recommendations.

Recent STEW Meetings with Long-term Monitoring Priorities Assessment Item

Meeting Date	Agenda Item	Meeting Documents
Apr. 24, 2024	Item 3: Long-term Monitoring Priorities Assessment Process - Decisions & Next Steps	Slides (pg. 11 - 33) Notes (pg 4 - 6) Recording
Mar. 27, 2024	Process overview & update Reflection, synthesis, priority setting	Slides Notes Recording
Feb. 28, 2024	Process overview & update Tribe / Agency / CBO Presentations	Slides Notes Recording
Jan. 31, 2024	Regular STEW Meeting Tribe / Agency / CBO Presentations	Slides Notes Recording
Jan. 24, 2024	Process overview & update Water Boards Presentations	Slides Notes Recording
Dec. 20, 2023	Process overview & update Water Boards Presentations	Slides Notes Recording
Nov. 29, 2023	Process overview & update Q&A / Open Forum	Slides Notes Recording
Oct. 18, 2023	Item 7. 2024 Long-term Monitoring Priorities Assessment Process	Slides (pg. 72 - 82) Notes (pg 8 - 10) Recording
Jan. 18, 2023	Item 6. Planning for 2024 Long-term Monitoring Priorities Assessment	Slides (pg. 32 - 35) Notes (pg 7 - 8) Recording

Upcoming STEW Meetings

Meeting Date	Meeting Focus (<i>Tentative</i>)	Meeting Documents
Jul. 31, 2024 9:30 am - 12:30 pm PT	Regular STEW Meeting Presentation of DRAFT long-term & 2025 monitoring plans	Registration Link*
Oct. 30, 2024 9:30 am - 12:30 pm PT	Regular STEW Meeting Presentation of FINAL long-term & 2025 monitoring plans	Registration Link*

* Attendee can register for all Regular STEW meetings at one time